## Computer Graphics

- Introduction to Ray Tracing -

Philipp Slusallek

## Rendering Algorithms

- Rendering
- Definition: Given a 3D scene description as input and a camera, generate a 2D image as a view from the camera of the 3D scene
- Algorithms
- Ray Tracing
- Declarative scene description
- Physically-based simulation of light transport
- Throughout the scene from light sources to the camera
- Rasterization
- Traditional procedural/imperative drawing of scene content
- One triangle at a time (conceptually)
- See later in the course!


## Scene Description in General

- Surface Geometry
- 3D geometry of objects in a scene
- Geometric primitives - triangles, polygons, spheres, ...
- Surface Appearance
- Color, texture, absorption, reflection, refraction, subsurface scattering
- Types of materials: Diffuse, glossy, mirror, glass, ...
- Illumination
- Position and emission characteristics of light sources
- Note: Light also reflects off of surfaces!
- Secondary/indirect/global illumination
- Assumption: air/empty space is totally transparent
- Simplification that excludes scattering effects in participating media or volumes, e.g. smoke, solid object (CT scan), ...
- See later in course
- Camera
- View point, viewing direction, field of view, resolution, ...


## OVERVIEW OF RAY-TRACING

## Light Transport (1)



## Light Transport (2)

- Light Distribution in a Scene
- Dynamic equilibrium: As much light is absorbed as is emitted
- Forward Light Transport
- Shoot photons from the light sources into scene
- Scatter at surfaces and record when a detector is hit
- Photons that hit the camera produce the final image
- Most photons will not reach the camera!
- Particle or Light Tracing
- Backward Light Transport
- Start at the detector (camera)
- Trace only paths that might transport light towards camera
- May be hard to find and connect to light sources
- Ray Tracing


## Ray Tracing Is...

- Fundamental rendering algorithm
- Automatic, simple and intuitive
- Easy to understand and implement
- Delivers "correct" images by default
- Powerful and efficient
- Covers many optical global effects


Perspective Machine, Albrecht Dürer

- Shadows, reflections, refractions, ...
- Efficient real-time implementation in SW - and now also in HW!
- Can work in parallel and distributed environments
- Logarithmic scalability with scene size: O(log n) vs. O(n)
- Output sensitive and demand-driven approach
- Concept of light rays is not new
- Empedocles (492-432 BC), Renaissance (Dürer, 1525), ...
- Used in lens design, geometric optics, neutron transport, ...


## Fundamental Ray Tracing Steps

- Generation of primary rays
- Rays from viewpoint along viewing directions into 3D scene
- (At least) one ray per picture element (pixel) in image plane
- Ray casting
- Traversal of spatial index structures (acceleration structures)
- For avoiding costly but unnecessary intersection computations
- Ray-primitive intersection $\rightarrow$ hit point
- Shading the hit point
- Compute light towards camera $\rightarrow$ pixel color
- Light power (really "radiance") travelling along primary ray
- Needed for computation
- Local reflection/scattering properties: material color, texture, ...
- Local illumination at intersection point
- Can be hard to determine correctly (light could come from anywhere)
- Simple: Test direct connection to lights ("shadow rays")
- Compute transparency/mirror effects through recursive tracing of rays


## Ray Tracing Pipeline (1)



## Ray Tracing Pipeline (2)



## Ray Tracing Pipeline (3)



## Ray Tracing Pipeline (4)



## Ray Tracing Pipeline (5)



## Recursive Ray Tracing Pipeline (6)



## Recursive Ray Tracing Pipeline (7)



## Recursive Ray Tracing Pipeline (8)



## Recursive Ray Tracing Pipeline (9)



## Recursive Ray Tracing



- Searching recursively for paths to light sources
- Interaction of light \& material at intersections
- Trace rays to light sources
- Recursively trace new ray paths in reflection \& refraction directions



## Ray Tracing Algorithm

- Trace(ray)
- Search the next intersection point (hit, material)
- Return Shade(ray, hit, material) $\rightarrow$ radiance/color
- Shade(ray, hit, material)
- If object is emissive (i.e. light source)
- Add radiance emitted towards ray to the reflected radiance
- For each light source
- if ShadowTrace(ray towards light source, distance to light)
- Compute radiance emitted from light source towards shadow ray
- Calculate radiance reflected at hit point towards incoming ray
- Adding radiance to the reflected radiance
- If mirroring material
- Recursively calculate radiance from reflected direction:
- Trace(ReflectRay(ray, hit))
- Adding mirrored radiance to the reflected radiance
- Similar for transmissive materials
- Return reflected radiance
- ShadowTrace(ray, dist)
- Return false, if intersection with distance < dist has been found
- Can be changed to handle transparent objects as well
- But not with refraction - WHY?


## Ray Tracing Algorithm

- Trace(ray)
- Search the next intersection point (hit, material)
- Return Shade(ray, hit, material) $\rightarrow$ radiance/color
- Shade(ray, hit, material)
- If object is emissive (i.e. light source)
- Add radiance emitted towards ray to the reflected radiance
- For each light source
- if ShadowTrace(ray towards light source!!, distance to light)
- Compute radiance emitted from light source towards shadow ray
- Calculate radiance reflected at hit point towards incoming ray
- Adding radiance to the reflected radiance
- If mirroring material
- Recursively calculate radiance from reflected direction:
- Trace(ReflectRay(ray, hit))
- Adding mirrored radiance to the reflected radiance
- Similar for transmissive materials
- Return reflected radiance
- ShadowTrace(ray, dist)
- Return false, if intersection with distance < dist has been found
- Can be changed to handle transparent objects as well
- But not with refraction - WHY?


## Shading (Material)

- Intersection point determines primary ray's "color"
- Diffuse object: isotropic reflection of illumination at hit point
- No variation with viewing angle: diffuse (or Lambertian)
- Specular: Perfect reflection/refraction (mirror, glass)
- Only one outgoing direction each $\rightarrow$ Trace secondary ray path(s)
- More general reflectance models
- Appearance depends on illumination and viewing direction
- Local Bi-directional Reflectance Distribution Function (BRDF)
- Illumination
- Point/directional light sources
- Slight generalization: Area light sources
- Approximate with multiple samples / shadow rays
- Global illumination (computes also indirect illumination)
- See Realistic Image Synthesis (RIS) course in next semester
- More details later


## Common Approximations

- Usually RGB color model (red, green, blue)
- Instead of full spectrum $\rightarrow$ later
- Light only from finite \# of light sources
- Instead of full indirect light from all directions
- Approximate material reflectance properties
- Diffuse: light reflected uniformly in all directions
- Specular: perfect reflection, refraction
- Or mix of these two
- Reflection models are often empirical
- Often using Phong/Blinn shading model (or variation thereof)
- But physically-based models are available as well
$\rightarrow$ later


## Ray Tracing Features

- Incorporates into a single framework:
- Hidden surface removal
- Front to back traversal
- Early termination once first hit point is found
- Shadow computation
- Shadow rays are traced between a point on a surface \& light sources
- Exact simulation of some light paths
- Reflection (reflected rays at a mirror surface)
- Refraction (refracted rays at a transparent surface, Snell's law)
- Limitations
- Many reflections or refractions
- Exponential increase in number of rays
- Indirect illumination requires many rays to sample all incoming directions
- Easily gets inefficient for full global illumination computations
- Solved with Path Tracing ( $\rightarrow$ RIS course)


## Ray Tracing Can...

- Produce Realistic Images
- By simulating light transport



## What is Possible?

- Models Physics of Global Light Transport
- Dependable, physically-correct visualization



## VW Visualization Center



## Realistic Visualization: CAD



## Realistic Visualization: VR/AR



## Lighting Simulation



## What is Possible?

- Huge Models
- Logarithmic scaling in scene size
12.5 Million

Triangles


~1 Billion Triangles

## Outdoor Environments

- $90 \times 10^{\wedge 12}$ (trillion) triangles



## Boeing 777



Boeing 777: ~350 million individual polygons, ~30 GB on disk

## Volume Visualization

- Iso-surface rendering



## Games? (in 2006)



## Games!



## Ray Tracing in CG

- In the Past (until end of 80ies)
- Was computationally very demanding (minutes to hours per frame)
- Tried hard to speed it up, but always too slow $\rightarrow$ only off-line use
- "Lost generation" (1990ies)
- Believed ray tracing would not be suitable for HW implementations
- Believed ray tracing would always be slower than rasterization
- More Recently
- Interactive ray tracing on supercomputers [Parker, U. Utah‘98]
- Interactive ray tracing on PCs [Wald‘01]
- Distributed real-time ray tracing on PC clusters [Wald'01]
- RPU: First full HW implementation [Siggraph 2005]
- Commercial tools: Embree (Intel/CPU), OptiX (Nvidia/GPU)
- Complete film industry has switched to ray tracing (Monte-Carlo)
- Own conference
- Symposium on Interactive RT, now High-Performance Graphics (HPG)
- Ray tracing systems
- Research: PBRT (offline, physically-based, based on book, OSS), Mitsuba-2 renderer (EPFL), Rodent (SB), ...
- Products: Blender (OSS), V-Ray (Chaos Group), Arnold \& VRED (Autodesk), Corona (Render Legion), MentalRay/iRay (MI), ...


## Ray Casting Outside CG

- Tracing/Casting a ray
- Special type of query
- "Is there a primitive along a ray"
- "How far is the closest primitive"
- Other uses than rendering
- Visibility computation
- Volume computation
- Collision detection
- Acoustics
- Radar
- ...


## RAY-PRIMITIVE INTERSECTIONS

## Basic Math - Ray

- Ray parameterization
$-r(t)=\vec{o}+t \vec{d}, \quad \mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$ : origin and direction
- Ray
- All points on the graph of $r(t)$, with $\mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R}_{0+}$



## Pinhole Camera Model

```
// For given image resolution {resx, resy}
// Loop over pixel raster coordinates [0, res-1]
for(prcx = 0; prcx < resx; prcx++)
    for(prcy = 0; prcy < resy; prcy++)
    {
        // Normalized device coordinates [0, 1]
        ndcx = (prcx + 0.5) / resx;
        ndcy = (prcy + 0.5) / resy;
        // Screen space coordinates [-1, 1]
        sscx = ndcx * 2 - 1;
        sscy = ndcy * 2 - 1;
        // Generate direction through pixel center
        d = f + sscx \cdot x + sscy · y;
        d = d / |d|; // May normalize here
        // Trace ray and assign color to pixel
        color = trace_ray(o, d) ;
        write_pixel(prcx, prcy, color);
    }
```

Image plane


## Basic Math - Sphere

- Sphere $S$
- $\vec{c} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}, r \in \mathbb{R}$ : center and radius
$-\forall \vec{p} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}: \vec{p} \in S \Leftrightarrow(\vec{p}-\vec{c}) \cdot(\vec{p}-\vec{c})-r^{2}=0$
- The distance between points on the sphere and its center equals the radius



## Ray-Sphere Intersection

- Given
- Ray: $r(t)=\vec{o}+t \vec{d}, \quad \mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
- Sphere: $\vec{c} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}, r \in \mathbb{R}$ :
- $\forall \vec{p} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}: \vec{p} \in S \Leftrightarrow(\vec{p}-\vec{c}) \cdot(\vec{p}-\vec{c})-r^{2}=0$
- Find closest intersection point
- Algebraic approach: substitute ray equation
- $(\vec{p}-\vec{c}) \cdot(\vec{p}-\vec{c})-r^{2}=0$ with $\vec{p}=\vec{o}+t \vec{d}$
- $t^{2} \vec{d} \cdot \vec{d}+2 t \vec{d} \cdot(\vec{o}-\vec{c})+(\vec{o}-\vec{c}) \cdot(\vec{o}-\vec{c})-r^{2}=0$
- Solve for $t$


## Ray-Sphere Intersection (2)

- Given
- Ray: $r(t)=\vec{o}+t \vec{d}, \quad \mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
- Sphere: $\vec{c} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}, r \in \mathbb{R}:$
- $\forall \vec{p} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}: \vec{p} \in S \Leftrightarrow(\vec{p}-\vec{c}) \cdot(\vec{p}-\vec{c})-r^{2}=0$
- Find closest intersection point
- Geometric approach
- Ray and center span a plane
- Solve in 2D
- Compute $|\vec{b}-\vec{o}|,|\vec{b}-\vec{c}|$
- Such that $\Varangle o b c=90^{\circ}$
- Intersection(s) if $|\vec{b}-\vec{c}| \leq r$
- Be aware of floating point issues if o is far from sphere



## Basic Math - Plane

- Plane $P$
- $\vec{n}, \vec{a} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$ : normal and point a in $P$ (Hesse normal form for plane)
$-\forall \vec{p} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}: \vec{p} \in P \Leftrightarrow(\vec{p}-\vec{a}) \cdot \vec{n}=0$
- The difference vector between any two points on the plane is either 0 or orthogonal to the plane's normal



## Ray-Plane Intersection

- Given
- Ray: $r(t)=\vec{o}+t \vec{d}, \quad t \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
- Plane: $\vec{n}, \vec{a} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$ : normal and point in $P$
- Compute intersection point
- Plane equation: $\vec{p} \in P \Leftrightarrow(\vec{p}-\vec{a}) \cdot \vec{n}=0$

$$
\Leftrightarrow \quad \vec{p} \cdot \vec{n}-D=0, \text { with } D=\vec{a} \cdot \vec{n}
$$

- Substitute ray parameterization: $(\vec{o}+t \vec{d}) \cdot \vec{n}-D=0$
- Solve for $t$
- How many intersections could there be?


## Ray-Plane Intersection

- Given
- Ray: $r(t)=\vec{o}+t \vec{d}, \quad \mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
- Plane: $\vec{n}, \vec{a} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$ : normal and point in $P$
- Compute intersection point
- Plane equation: $\vec{p} \in P \Leftrightarrow(\vec{p}-\vec{a}) \cdot \vec{n}=0$ $\Leftrightarrow \vec{p} \cdot \vec{n}-D=0$, with $D=\vec{a} \cdot \vec{n}$
- Substitute ray parameterization: $(\vec{o}+t \vec{d}) \cdot \vec{n}-D=0$
- Solve for $t$
- 1: General case
- 0: Ray is parallel to but offset from plane
- $\infty$ : Ray lies within plane


## Ray-Disc Intersection

- Intersect ray with plane
- Discard intersection if ||p - a|| > r


## Basic Math - Triangle

- Triangle $T$
$-\vec{a}, \vec{b}, \vec{c} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$ : vertices
- Affine combinations of $\vec{a}, \vec{b}, \vec{c} \rightarrow$ points in the plane
- Non-negative coefficients that sum up to $1 \rightarrow$ points in the triangle
$-\forall \vec{p} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}: \vec{p} \in T \Leftrightarrow \exists \lambda_{1,2,3} \in \mathbb{R}_{0+}, \lambda_{1}+\lambda_{2}+\lambda_{3}=1$ and

$$
\vec{p}=\lambda_{1} \vec{a}+\lambda_{2} \vec{b}+\lambda_{3} \vec{c}
$$

- Barycentric coordinates $\lambda_{1,2,3}$
- $\lambda_{1}=A_{p b c} / A_{a b c}$, etc.
- A: signed area of triangle, based on CLW/CCW orientation


## Barycentric Coordinates (BCs)

- Triangle $T$
$-\vec{a}, \vec{b}, \vec{c} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$ : vertices
- $\lambda_{1,2,3}$ : Barycentric coordinates
$-\lambda_{1}+\lambda_{2}+\lambda_{3}=1$
$-\lambda_{1}=A_{p b c} / A_{a b c}$, etc.
- Easy geometric interpretation



## Triangle Intersection: Plane-Based

- Compute intersection with triangle's plane
- Plane equation easily computable from vertices via cross product
- Compute barycentric coordinates
- Signed areas of subtriangles
- Can be done in 2D, after "projection" onto major plane, depending on largest component of normal vector
- Maximizes area and numerical stability
- Test for positive BCs
- Issues:
- Edges of neighboring triangles might not be identical
- Due to inaccuracies of floats
- Need a better method!



## Triangle Intersection: Edge-Based

- 3D linear function across triangle (3D edge functions)
- Ray: $\vec{o}+t \vec{d}$,
- Triangle: $\vec{a}, \vec{b}, \vec{c} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
$\mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$



## Triangle Intersection: Edge-Based

- 3D linear function across triangle (3D edge functions)
- Ray: $\vec{o}+t \vec{d}$,
$\mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
- Triangle: $\vec{a}, \vec{b}, \vec{c} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
$-\overrightarrow{n_{a b}}=(\vec{b}-\vec{o}) \times(\vec{a}-\vec{o})$
$-\left|\overrightarrow{n_{a b}}\right|$ is the signed area of $\Delta o a b$ (2x)



## Triangle Intersection: Edge-Based

- 3D linear function across triangle (3D edge functions)
- Ray: $\vec{o}+t \vec{d}$,
$\mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
- Triangle: $\vec{a}, \vec{b}, \vec{c} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
$-\overrightarrow{n_{a b}}=(\vec{b}-\vec{o}) \times(\vec{a}-\vec{o})$
$-\left|\overrightarrow{n_{a b}}\right|$ is the signed area of $\Delta o a b(2 x)$
$-\lambda_{3}^{*}(t)=\overrightarrow{n_{a b}} \cdot t \vec{d}$
- Volume of tetrahedra obap (6x)
- For $t=t_{h i t}$



## Triangle Intersection: Edge-Based

- 3D linear function across triangle (3D edge functions)
- Ray: $\vec{o}+t \vec{d}$,
$\mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
- Triangle: $\vec{a}, \vec{b}, \vec{c} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
$-\overrightarrow{n_{a b}}=(\vec{b}-\vec{o}) \times(\vec{a}-\vec{o})$
- $\left|\overrightarrow{n_{a b}}\right|$ is the signed area of $\Delta o a b$ (2x)
$-\lambda_{3}^{*}(t)=\overrightarrow{n_{a b}} \cdot t \vec{d}$
- Volume of tetrahedra obap (6x)
- For $t=t_{h i t}$
$-\lambda_{1,2}^{*}(t)=\overrightarrow{n_{b c, a c}} \cdot t \vec{d}$
- Normalize
- $\lambda_{i}=\frac{\lambda_{i}^{*}(t)}{\lambda_{1}^{*}(t)+\lambda_{2}^{*}(t)+\lambda_{3}^{*}(t)}, i=1,2,3$



## Triangle Intersection: Edge-Based

- 3D linear function across triangle (3D edge functions)
- Ray: $\vec{o}+t \vec{d}$,
$\mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
- Triangle: $\vec{a}, \vec{b}, \vec{c} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
$-\overrightarrow{n_{a b}}=(\vec{b}-\vec{o}) \times(\vec{a}-\vec{o})$
$-\left|\overrightarrow{n_{a b}}\right|$ is the signed area of $\triangle o a b(2 x)$
$-\lambda_{3}^{*}(t)=\overrightarrow{n_{a b}} \cdot t \vec{d}$
- Volume of tetrahedra obap (6x)
- For $t=t_{h i t}$
$-\lambda_{1,2}^{*}(t)=\overrightarrow{n_{b c, a c}} \cdot t \vec{d}$
- Normalize

$$
\text { - } \lambda_{i}=\frac{\lambda_{i}^{*}(t)}{\lambda_{1}^{*}(t)+\lambda_{2}^{*}(t)+\lambda_{3}^{*}(t)}, i=1,2,3
$$

- Hit, if all BCs positive:

- Compute $\vec{p}=\lambda_{1} \vec{a}+\lambda_{2} \vec{b}+\lambda_{3} \vec{c}$


## Nu® Rer

- Implicit
$-f(x, y, z)=v$
- Ray equation
$-x=x_{0}+t x_{d}$
$-y=y_{0}+t y_{d}$
$-z=z_{o}+t z_{d}$
- Solve for t
Elliptic paraboloid


| Cone | $\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{y^{2}}{b^{2}}-\frac{z^{2}}{c^{2}}=0$ |
| :--- | :--- |
| Circular conenerate quadric surfaces |  |
| (special case of cone) | $\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{y^{2}}{a^{2}}-\frac{z^{2}}{b^{2}}=0$ |
| Elliptic cylinder | $\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{y^{2}}{b^{2}}=1$ |
| Circular cylinder (special case of elliptic cylinder) | $\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{y^{2}}{a^{2}}=1$ |


| Circular paraboloid(special case of elliptic paraboloid) $\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{y^{2}}{a^{2}}-z=0$ |
| :--- |
| Hyperbolic paraboloid |
| $\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}-\frac{y^{2}}{b^{2}}-z=0$ |
| Hyperboloid of one sheet |
| $\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{y^{2}}{b^{2}}-\frac{z^{2}}{c^{2}}=1$ |
| Hyperboloid of two sheets |
| $\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{y^{2}}{b^{2}}-\frac{z^{2}}{c^{2}}=-1$ |

Spheroid (special case of ellipsoid)

Sphere (special case of spheroid)
$\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{y^{2}}{b^{2}}+\frac{z^{2}}{c^{2}}=1$
$\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{y^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{z^{2}}{b^{2}}=1$
$\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{y^{2}}{a^{2}}+\frac{z^{2}}{a^{2}}=1$

Cone

|  |  |
| :--- | :--- |
|  | $\frac{x^{2}}{a^{2}}-\frac{y^{2}}{b^{2}}=1$ |
|  | $x^{2}+2 a y=0$ |



## Axis Aligned Bounding Box

- Given
- Ray: $\vec{o}+t \vec{d}, \quad \mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
- Axis aligned bounding box (AABB): $\overrightarrow{p_{\min }}, \overrightarrow{p_{\max }} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$



## Ray-Box Intersection

- Given
- Ray: $\vec{o}+t \vec{d}, \quad \mathrm{t} \in \mathbb{R} ; \vec{o}, \vec{d} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
- Axis aligned bounding box (AABB): $\overrightarrow{p_{\text {min }}}, \overrightarrow{p_{\text {max }}} \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$
- "Slabs test" for ray-box intersection
- Ray enters the box in all dimensions before exiting in any
$-\max \left(\left\{t_{i}^{\text {near }} \mid i=x, y, z\right\}\right)<\min \left(\left\{t_{i}^{f a r} \mid i=x, y, z\right\}\right)$




## History of Intersection Algorithms

- Ray-geometry intersection algorithms
- Polygons:
- Quadrics, CSG:
- Recursive Ray Tracing:
- Tori:
- Bicubic patches:
- Algebraic surfaces:
- Swept surfaces:
- Fractals:
- Deformations:
- NURBS:
- Subdivision surfaces:
[Appel '68]
[Goldstein \& Nagel '71]
[Whitted '79]
[Roth '82]
[Whitted '80, Kajiya '82]
[Hanrahan '82]
[Kajiya '83, van Wijk '84]
[Kajiya'83]
[Barr '86]
[Stürzlinger '98]
[Kobbelt et al '98]


## Precision Problems

- E.g., cause of „surface acne"


